Michael A. Cohen, OSB #965776 Email: mcohen@schwabe.com Nika Aldrich, OSB #160306 Email: naldrich@schwabe.com

SCHWABE, WILLIAMSON & WYATT, P.C.

1211 SW 5th Ave., Suite 1900

Portland, OR 97204 Telephone: 503.222.9981 Facsimile: 503.796.2900

(Additional Counsel Shown on Signature Page)

Of Attorneys for Plaintiffs

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

## FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

TREVARI MEDIA LLC, an Oregon limited liability company, and UNDERWATER INVESTIGATIONS LLC, an Oregon limited liability company,

Plaintiffs,

v.

JOSHUA CANTU, an individual, doing business as JUKE MOTION PICTURES,

Defendant.

No. 6:23-cv-01879-MK

PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION RE PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS MOTION TO STRIKE DEFENDANT'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIMS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

Plaintiffs Trevari Media, LLC and Underwater Investigations, LLC, hereby submit their objections to the June 20, 2024 Findings and Recommendation (ECF 30) ("F&R") granting in part and denying in part Plaintiffs' Omnibus Motion to Strike Defendant's Affirmative Defenses and Dismiss Defendant's Counterclaims for Failure to State a Claim (the "Motion").

Page 1 PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION RE PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS MOTION TO STRIKE DEFENDANT'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND TO DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIMS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

Plaintiffs have three (3) objections based on errors that likely occurred due to the extraordinary number of Defendant's Affirmative Defenses. They are as follows:

 Page 5, Sec I (Negative Defenses): The 12<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense was withdrawn by Defendant. The second sentence in Footnote 2 incorrectly includes the 12<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense as still plead. Section I relies on Footnote 2 to state what the ruling is. Therefore, Footnote 2 should be revised as follows:

"Defendant voluntarily withdrew his seventh, eighth, twelfth, seventeenth, twenty-second, twenty-seventh, twenty-ninth, thirty-first, and thirty-seventh defenses, so this portion of the opinion only analyzes Plaintiffs' argument with respect to the fifth, sixth, twelfth, and fourteenth affirmative defenses."

2. Pages 5-6, Sec. II (Legally Cognizable Defenses): The 12<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defenses were withdrawn by Defendant, but mistakenly included as still plead in Footnote 3, as well as the last sentence of Section II. Respectfully, these should be deleted from Footnote 3 as follows:

"Defendant voluntarily withdrew several of the affirmative defenses Plaintiffs challenge as not 'legally cognizable.' The Court therefore only considers the Defendant's first, sixth, twelfth, seventeenth, and eighteenth affirmative defenses which were not withdrawn here."

and the last sentence of Section II, as follows:

"Accordingly, Plaintiffs' motion as to Defendant's first, sixth, twelfth, seventeenth, and eighteenth affirmative defenses should be denied."

- 3. There is no ruling on the 21<sup>st</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup>, 24<sup>th</sup>, 33<sup>rd</sup>, 36<sup>th</sup>, 39<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> or 41<sup>st</sup> Affirmative Defenses. As noted in the F&R, the two categories of issues with the Affirmative
- Page 2 PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION RE PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS MOTION TO STRIKE DEFENDANT'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND TO DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIMS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

Defenses are that 1) the affirmative defense is not recognized under applicable law, or 2) it is insufficiently plead. For ease of reference, the Affirmative Defenses that have yet to be ruled upon are listed as follows, along with the issue that applies to them, and where they can be found in the Motion:

- a. 21<sup>st</sup> Affirmative Defense (Fail Exercise Due Care): Not recognized under applicable law. Motion p. 5.
- b. 23<sup>rd</sup> Affirmative Defense (Third Party Fault): Not recognized under applicable
   law. Motion p. 5.
- c. 24<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense (Superseding Clause): Not recognized under applicable law. Motion p. 6.
- d. 33<sup>rd</sup> Affirmative Defense (Duplicative Claim): Insufficiently Plead. Motion p.
   11.
- e. 36<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense (Actual License): Insufficiently Plead. Motion p. 12.
- f. 39<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense (Superseding Agreement): Not recognized under applicable law. Motion p. 6.
- g. 40<sup>th</sup> Affirmative Defense (Implied License): Insufficiently Plead. Motion p.
   13.
- h. 41<sup>st</sup> Affirmative Defense (Alter Ego): Not recognized under applicable law.
   Motion p. 7.

## **CONCLUSION**

Plaintiffs respectfully request that, upon accepting the findings and recommendations and issuing an Order, the Court modify footnotes 2 and 3 and the last sentence in Section II, as

Page 3 PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION RE PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS MOTION TO STRIKE DEFENDANT'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND TO DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIMS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM

identified above. Plaintiffs also respectfully request that the Court grant the Motion with respect to the 21<sup>st</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup>, 24<sup>th</sup>, 33<sup>rd</sup>, 36<sup>th</sup>, 39<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 41<sup>st</sup> Affirmative Defenses.

Dated July 3, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

## SCHWABE WILLIAMSON & WYATT

By: s/ Nika Aldrich

Michael A. Cohen, OSB #965776 Email: mcohen@schwabe.com Nika Aldrich, OSB #160306 Email: naldrich@schwabe.com 1211 SW 5<sup>th</sup> Ave., Suite 1900

Portland, OR 97204

Telephone: (503) 222-9981 Facsimile: (503) 796-2900

David Ludwig, (pro hac vice)
Email: dludwig@dbllawyers.com
Thomas Dunlap, (pro hac vice)
Email: tdunlap@dbllawyers.com
Jason Witten, (pro hac vice)
Email: jwitten@dbllawyers.com
DUNLAP, BENNETT & LUDWIG,
PLLC
211 Church St. SE
Leesburg, VA 20175

Telephone: 703-777-7319 Facsimile: 703-777-3656

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Page 4 PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO THE FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION RE PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS MOTION TO STRIKE DEFENDANT'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND TO DISMISS DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIMS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM